



County Hall  
Cardiff  
CF10 4UW  
Tel: (029) 2087 2000

Neuadd y Sir  
Caerdydd  
CF10 4UW  
Ffôn: (029) 2087 2000

## CORRESPONDENCE FOLLOWING THE COMMITTEE MEETING

**Committee** ENVIRONMENTAL SCRUTINY COMMITTEE

**Date and Time of Meeting** TUESDAY, 16 FEBRUARY 2016, 2.00 PM

Please find below correspondence send by the Committee Chair following the meeting, together with any responses received.

For any further details, please contact [scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk](mailto:scrutinyviewpoints@cardiff.gov.uk)

8 **Correspondence Following the Committee Meeting** *(Pages 1 - 16)*

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/PM/GH/16.02.16

16<sup>th</sup> February 2016

Councillor Graham Hinchey,  
Cabinet Member for Corporate Services & Performance,  
County Hall,  
Atlantic Wharf,  
Cardiff,  
CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Hinchey,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016**

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016. As you are aware the meeting considered the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2016 – 2018 & 2016/17 Draft Budget Proposals'. In reviewing these proposals the Committee used the following documents to set the context of the discussion:

- Draft Corporate Plan 2016-18;
- Post Consultation Changes – Includes a total summary of the post consultation changes (£14.095 million), a schedule of amended 2016/17 savings proposals, post consultation changes – financial resilience mechanisms & additional pressures;
- 2016/17 Proposals Overview – Includes an overview of the 2016/17 savings proposals, Council wide budget savings proposals 2016/17, Addressable Spend – budget savings proposals 2016/17;
- City Operations Directorate - Draft Budget Savings Proposals;
- City Operations Directorate – Financial Pressures;
- City Operations Directorate – Capital Programme;
- City Operations Directorate – Employee Implications;
- City Operations Directorate – Controllable Budget Analysis;
- 'Changes for Cardiff – Consultation Results & Feedback Report on the City of Cardiff Council's 2016/17 Budget Proposals – Executive Summary' & relevant sections from the report;
- City Operations Directorate – Equality Impact Assessments.

This letter contains details of observations which were noted during discussion and agreed by Members during the Way Forward. The comments made below refer to the Corporate Overview which was provided by yourself and the Corporate Director Resources:

- Members noted and welcomed the progress achieved in reducing sickness levels in the City Operations Directorate and indeed across the Council as a whole. The Committee agreed that this would be beneficial in addressing the Council's difficult and ongoing financial position and will continue to monitor progress when reviewing the City Operations Directorate performance on a quarterly basis.
- Members noted that this complemented the work being done to reduce the money spent on agency staff and welcomed assurances that savings would not be made by simply reducing posts creating agency overspends later in the financial year.
- Members discussed the financial pressures that the increased costs for national insurance and complying with the living wage directives have created. In particular they welcomed the Council proposal to cover 100% of both of these costs in the schools' budgets. We appreciate that the Council cannot dictate to individual schools how they spend this increase on staff they have engaged via their delegated budgets; however, we share the Council's expectations that they will allocate the extra monies for the stated purpose.
- Members noted with concern that the Council's general and earmarked reserves are very low in comparison to the size of the Council's overall budget and when compared to other neighbouring authorities. We ask you to note our concerns and that both the Committee and particularly the Audit Committee should pay close attention to the level of these reserves in the coming financial year.

This letter does not require a response.

Regards,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "P. D. Mitchell". The signature is written in a cursive, slightly slanted style.

Councillor Paul Mitchell Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc to:

Councillor Bob Derbyshire, Cabinet Member for the Environment

Councillor Ramesh Patel, Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability

Christine Salter, Corporate Director Resources

Allan Evans, Operational Manager, Service Accountancy

Andrew Gregory, Director for the City Operations Directorate

Tara King, Assistant Director for the City Operations Directorate

Marie Rosenthal, Director for Governance & Legal Services

Paul Keeping, Operational Manager, Scrutiny Services

Claire Deguara, Cabinet Office Manager

Cheryl Cornelius, Cabinet Support Manager

Councillor Nigel Howells, Chair of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee

Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/PM/RP/16.02.16

16<sup>th</sup> February 2016

Councillor Ramesh Patel,  
Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability,  
County Hall,  
Atlantic Wharf,  
Cardiff,  
CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Patel,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016**

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016. As you are aware the meeting considered the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2016 – 2018 & 2016/17 Draft Budget Proposals'. In reviewing these proposals the Committee used the following documents to set the context of the discussion:

- Draft Corporate Plan 2016-18;
- Post Consultation Changes – Includes a total summary of the post consultation changes (£14.095 million), a schedule of amended 2016/17 savings proposals, post consultation changes – financial resilience mechanisms & additional pressures;
- 2016/17 Proposals Overview – Includes an overview of the 2016/17 savings proposals, Council wide budget savings proposals 2016/17, Addressable Spend – budget savings proposals 2016/17;
- City Operations Directorate - Draft Budget Savings Proposals;
- City Operations Directorate – Financial Pressures;
- City Operations Directorate – Capital Programme;
- City Operations Directorate – Employee Implications;
- City Operations Directorate – Controllable Budget Analysis;
- 'Changes for Cardiff – Consultation Results & Feedback Report on the City of Cardiff Council's 2016/17 Budget Proposals – Executive Summary' & relevant sections from the report;

- City Operations Directorate – Equality Impact Assessments.

This letter contains the recommendations, observations and requests for information agreed by Members during the Way Forward at the end of the meeting, which we hope will be of assistance to you in considering and shaping the final budget recommendations. The proposals that are allocated against the City Operations Directorate and which fall within the scope of your portfolio are listed below:

### **Savings Line 15 - City Operations – Building Control – Improve Business Process Efficiency**

- Members were concerned about the £46,000 increase in income allocated against Building Control described as efficiencies. They feel that this is a service which struggles to meet current demand and that clearly needs additional funding. With this in mind I would be grateful if you could:
  - Consider reviewing the budget allocations to provide the service with some additional funding to help it meet the current demands;
  - Clarify how we currently deal with situations where building regulations are breached;
  - Confirm whether or not we issue fines against those who breach the regulations. If fines are not possible then can you outline what type action can be taken and how effective it is;
  - Confirm the total value of fines generated in past financial years for breaches of buildings regulations; how buildings regulations cases are managed by the courts and if / how we are able to recover Council costs, for example, the incurred legal and officer costs.

### **Financial Pressures – Line 3 – Supplementary Planning Guidance**

- Members welcomed the £75,000 of identified financial pressures support offered for the generation of updated Supplementary Planning Guidance (SPG) documents in the light of the recent LDP adoption. However, Members felt that this will only go a part of the way in addressing the Supplementary Planning Guidance requirements especially where public



consultation may be required. They were conscious that officer time and consultation for such work could be significant and, therefore, ask that a contingency be identified should this figure be exceeded – the Council could be open to a number of possible issues and legal challenges if the SPGs are incomplete or remain outdated.

### **Savings Line 19 – City Operations - Butetown Tunnel**

- A local Member explained that closing the Butetown Tunnel for maintenance at certain times of day caused significant traffic problems in the Butetown and Grangetown wards. You acknowledged and were sympathetic to the problem and agreed to look at what could be done to ensure that the tunnel is only closed for maintenance at off peak times to create the minimum possible transport congestion. I would be grateful if you could follow this up and provide the Committee with feedback on the whether the maintenance impacts can be reduced or not.

### **Savings Line 21 – City Operations – Increase Civil Parking Enforcement contribution to fund Transport / Environment improvements currently funded by base revenue budgets**

- Members noted the increase in income of £360,000 and an overall saving of £370,000 required against this budget line. They also welcomed your recent response to the letter following the 8<sup>th</sup> December 2015 which provided an income and expenditure summary of the Parking & Enforcement Account. The Committee will in the coming months review this response alongside the budget proposals and consider if further scrutiny on the matter is required.

### **Savings Line 37 – City Operations – Litter Enforcement – Increase enforcement powers to reduce Environmental Crime (Full Year Effect)**

- At the November 10<sup>th</sup> Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting Members received an item titled ‘Litter Management & Enforcement in Cardiff’. This considered a draft Cabinet report titled ‘City Operations –

Broadening Enforcement Powers to Improve the Public Realm' which was later received by the Cabinet at its meeting on the 12<sup>th</sup> November 2015. The report referenced a series of proposed activities, some of which will be implemented in April 2016. With this in mind Members will look to include an update report on the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Work Programme for the autumn.

### **Financial Resilience Mechanism – Targeted Interventions for Potholes**

- Members welcome the additional £320,000 allocated for addressing potholes in 2016/17. They received assurances that such repairs are not simply 'pothole patches' and that instead the Council applies a 'permanent reinstatement' approach to fixing the problem – i.e. removing a larger area surrounding the recurring pothole and replacing that.

### **Damage to the Highway from Heavy Vehicles**

- During the way forward Members agreed that some parts of Cardiff have a problem with heavy vehicles damaging roads which are / should be subject to traffic regulation order that limits the use of the road to vehicles below a particular weight. The Committee appreciates that policing weight restrictions is almost impossible but asks that the Council reviews existing cases where such traffic regulations have been proposed and also does what it can to raise the profile of existing vehicle weight restricting traffic regulation orders (TROs).

I would be grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the requests made in this letter.

Regards,



Councillor Paul Mitchell  
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc to:

Councillor Bob Derbyshire, Cabinet Member for the Environment

Councillor Graham Hinchey, Cabinet Member – Corporate Services & Performance

Andrew Gregory, Director for the City Operations Directorate

Tara King, Assistant Director for the City Operations Directorate

Matthew Wakelam, Operational Manager, Infrastructure & Operations

Christine Salter, Corporate Director Resources

Allan Evans, Operational Manager, Service Accountancy

Marie Rosenthal, Director for Governance & Legal Services

Paul Keeping, Operational Manager, Scrutiny Services

Claire Deguara, Cabinet Office Manager

Cheryl Cornelius, Cabinet Support Manager

Councillor Nigel Howells, Chair of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny Committee

Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee

This page is intentionally left blank

Ref: RDB/PM/BD/16.02.16

16<sup>th</sup> February 2016

Councillor Bob Derbyshire,  
Cabinet Member for the Environment,  
County Hall,  
Atlantic Wharf,  
Cardiff,  
CF10 4UW.



Dear Councillor Derbyshire,

**Environmental Scrutiny Committee – 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016**

On behalf of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee I would like to thank you and the officers for attending the Committee meeting on Tuesday 16<sup>th</sup> February 2016. As you are aware the meeting considered the 'Draft Corporate Plan 2016 – 2018 & 2016/17 Draft Budget Proposals'. In reviewing these proposals the Committee used the following documents to set the context of the discussion:

- Draft Corporate Plan 2016-18;
- Post Consultation Changes – Includes a total summary of the post consultation changes (£14.095 million), a schedule of amended 2016/17 savings proposals, post consultation changes – financial resilience mechanisms & additional pressures;
- 2016/17 Proposals Overview – Includes an overview of the 2016/17 savings proposals, Council wide budget savings proposals 2016/17, Addressable Spend – budget savings proposals 2016/17;
- City Operations Directorate - Draft Budget Savings Proposals;
- City Operations Directorate – Financial Pressures;
- City Operations Directorate – Capital Programme;
- City Operations Directorate – Employee Implications;
- City Operations Directorate – Controllable Budget Analysis;
- 'Changes for Cardiff – Consultation Results & Feedback Report on the City of Cardiff Council's 2016/17 Budget Proposals – Executive Summary' & relevant sections from the report;
- City Operations Directorate – Equality Impact Assessments.

This letter contains the recommendations, observations and requests for information agreed by the Members present during the Way Forward discussion conducted at the end of the meeting, which we hope will be of assistance to you in shaping the final budget recommendations. The proposals that are allocated against the City Operations Directorate and which fall within the scope of your portfolio are listed below:

### **Savings Line 13 – City Operations – New Operating Model**

- Members considered the £1.052 million savings allocated against the ‘New Operating Model for City Operations’. They understand that much of this saving is set against the delivery of the Alternative Delivery Model (ADM) for Infrastructure Services which was due to be jointly scrutinised by the Environmental Scrutiny Committee and the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny at a meeting on the 1<sup>st</sup> March 2016. This is no longer the case and it is now anticipated that the Full Business Case (FBC) for the Alternative Delivery Model for Infrastructure Services will not be received until the 12<sup>th</sup> May 2016. The Committee looks forward to scrutinising this item following the progress briefing that they will receive for the Alternative Delivery Model for Infrastructure Services on the 15<sup>th</sup> March 2016.

### **Savings Line 37 – City Operations – Litter Enforcement – Increase enforcement powers to reduce Environmental Crime (Full Year Effect)**

- At the November 10<sup>th</sup> Environmental Scrutiny Committee meeting Members received an item titled ‘Litter Management & Enforcement in Cardiff’. This item included consideration of a draft Cabinet report titled ‘City Operations – Broadening Enforcement Powers to Improve the Public Realm’ which was later received by the Cabinet at its meeting on the 12<sup>th</sup> November 2015. The report referenced a series of proposed activities, some of which will be implemented in April 2016. Members accepted that these new enforcement activities will take some time to make an impact and wished to include an update report on the Environmental Scrutiny Committee Work Programme 2016/17 for the autumn.

- A Member asked for a detailed breakdown of income generated by the Council for all types of littering fines in 2015/16. I would be grateful if you could provide the Committee with this information.

### **Recycle & Reuse Facilities**

- I would appreciate it if you could provide the Committee with a progress update for introducing new recycle and reuse facilities to Household Waste Recycling Centres in Cardiff. The Committee agreed that such facilities would complete the recycling hierarchy and provide an excellent resource which would champion the recycling message and support community groups. During the Way Forward a Member suggested taking this initiative a step further and trialling a street-based reuse and recycle scheme in Cardiff. Such a scheme would involve organising residents who wish to leave unwanted items (which are still fit for reuse) outside for collection on a specific day of the week. These items would then be taken to a reuse and recycle facility where they could be rehomed. Brighton & Hove City Council was mentioned as a Council which took such an approach and members recommended some research in this regard.

### **Member Briefing Email – 12<sup>th</sup> February 2016**

- You issued an email on the 12<sup>th</sup> February 2016 which referenced the impact that recent Household Waste Recycling Centre changes had made, with particular reference to the reduction of materials now received in Bessemer Close Household Waste Recycling Centre. In particular the email stated that:
  - *In the first month the Bessemer Close HWRC has seen a 16% reduction in overall tonnages received, which supports the initial research that 17% of all users for that site were not from Cardiff.*
  - *The data also suggest we have deterred a lot of builders as the building waste figures have seen the biggest drop at 115% over all sites and specifically 262% at the Bessemer Close site.*

Members would be grateful if you could provide clarification on these statements and provide the Committee with details of the actual data as the latter percentages in the email appear to be missing decimal points.

## **Savings Line 42 – City Operations – Regulatory Collaboration**

- The Community & Adult Services Scrutiny Committee previously reviewed the Regulatory Collaboration savings of £310,000 at their budget scrutiny meeting on the 15<sup>th</sup> February. They concluded that:

*‘Savings Line 42 – Members note that, whilst there is confidence that the savings will be achieved, the risk analysis ratings remain as Red/ Amber as 30% of the saving is predicated on raising additional income and this may be more difficult to achieve in South Wales than has been the case in parts of England that have followed a similar approach to Regulatory Services’.*

The Environmental Scrutiny Committee would like to agree with the caution about achievability expressed in this comment.

I would be therefore grateful if you would consider the above comments and provide a response to the requests made in this letter.

Regards,



Councillor Paul Mitchell  
Chairperson Environmental Scrutiny Committee

Cc to:

Councillor Ramesh Patel,  
Cabinet Member for Transport, Planning & Sustainability  
Councillor Graham Hinchey,  
Cabinet Member – Corporate Services & Performance  
Andrew Gregory, Director for the City Operations Directorate  
Tara King, Assistant Director for the City Operations Directorate  
David Lowe, Waste Operations Manager  
Christine Salter, Corporate Director Resources  
Allan Evans, Operational Manager, Service Accountancy



Marie Rosenthal, Director for Governance & Legal Services

Paul Keeping, Operational Manager, Scrutiny Services

Claire Deguara, Cabinet Office Manager

Cheryl Cornelius, Cabinet Support Manager

Councillor Nigel Howells, Chair of the Policy Review & Performance Scrutiny  
Committee

Members of the Environmental Scrutiny Committee

This page is intentionally left blank